

WEBVTT

1 00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:01.544 <v ->All right.</v>  
2 00:00:01.544 --> 00:00:02.377 Good afternoon everyone,  
3 00:00:02.377 --> 00:00:04.080 and welcome to our seminar today.  
4 00:00:04.080 --> 00:00:06.030 Thank you so much for joining us.  
5 00:00:06.030 --> 00:00:08.490 It's great to see you all,  
6 00:00:08.490 --> 00:00:13.380 and I think Amanda Millstein has the profile  
7 00:00:13.380 --> 00:00:15.960 that is perfectly fitting for our session today,  
8 00:00:15.960 --> 00:00:18.150 Climate Health Now.  
9 00:00:18.150 --> 00:00:19.440 My name is Laura Bothwell.  
10 00:00:19.440 --> 00:00:23.400 I'm with the Yale Center for Climate Change  
and Health  
11 00:00:23.400 --> 00:00:25.317 with the Global Initiative on Climate Change  
12 00:00:25.317 --> 00:00:27.780 and Public Health Ethics.  
13 00:00:27.780 --> 00:00:30.150 And today we are just thrilled  
14 00:00:30.150 --> 00:00:33.540 to be featuring Dr. Oscar Berglund.  
15 00:00:33.540 --> 00:00:37.200 He's a lecturer in international, public and  
social policy  
16 00:00:37.200 --> 00:00:39.420 at the University of Bristol,  
17 00:00:39.420 --> 00:00:41.790 where he is joining us from today.  
18 00:00:41.790 --> 00:00:43.860 He's a critical political economist,  
19 00:00:43.860 --> 00:00:46.050 researching climate activism.  
20 00:00:46.050 --> 00:00:48.600 He explores why, how, and to what effect  
21 00:00:48.600 --> 00:00:51.600 activists use disruptive forms of protests.  
22 00:00:51.600 --> 00:00:55.140 He also researches different converging and  
clashing visions  
23 00:00:55.140 --> 00:00:58.080 in the climate movement of how societies,  
economies,  
24 00:00:58.080 --> 00:01:01.350 and political systems may need to change.  
25 00:01:01.350 --> 00:01:02.977 Dr. Berglund is the author of,  
26 00:01:02.977 --> 00:01:06.540 "Extinction Rebellion and Climate Change  
Activism,"

27 00:01:06.540 --> 00:01:09.270 and contributes to debates about climate activism

28 00:01:09.270 --> 00:01:10.920 across various academic disciplines

29 00:01:10.920 --> 00:01:15.420 in international media and with activist groups.

30 00:01:15.420 --> 00:01:17.430 So we're so grateful for him

31 00:01:17.430 --> 00:01:20.610 to take the time to speak with us today.

32 00:01:20.610 --> 00:01:23.940 The seminar itself will be approximately 40 minutes,

33 00:01:23.940 --> 00:01:26.700 and then we'll have an option at the end

34 00:01:26.700 --> 00:01:29.130 for a conversation of Q&A.

35 00:01:29.130 --> 00:01:33.153 So with no further ado, I'll turn it over to Dr. Berglund.

36 00:01:34.320 --> 00:01:35.700 <v ->Thank you very much, Laura,</v>

37 00:01:35.700 --> 00:01:38.310 and thank you very much for having me.

38 00:01:38.310 --> 00:01:42.210 It's a great honor to be speaking to Yale.

39 00:01:42.210 --> 00:01:46.818 You know, it's a big deal and yeah, I'm not,

40 00:01:46.818 --> 00:01:50.460 I haven't spoken to American audiences that many times,

41 00:01:50.460 --> 00:01:54.630 so it's great to do that.

42 00:01:54.630 --> 00:01:55.530 So, yeah, I'll just crack on.

43 00:01:55.530 --> 00:01:58.350 So basically, I didn't know exactly what kind of composition

44 00:01:58.350 --> 00:02:00.780 of audience I was expecting here today,

45 00:02:00.780 --> 00:02:04.260 so I kind of presume that it's largely academic,

46 00:02:04.260 --> 00:02:08.730 but not necessarily the kind of political theory stuff

47 00:02:08.730 --> 00:02:11.790 that often ask these questions about, you know,

48 00:02:11.790 --> 00:02:12.900 I was asked to address

49 00:02:12.900 --> 00:02:16.120 kind of the ethics of civil disobedience,

50 00:02:16.120 --> 00:02:17.190 and I chose to put it as, you know,

51 00:02:17.190 --> 00:02:19.350 should we break the law to save the world?

52 00:02:19.350 --> 00:02:20.970 Which is partly an ethical question,

53 00:02:20.970 --> 00:02:22.470 but it's also, you know,

54 00:02:22.470 --> 00:02:27.470 one of politics and strategy and when it's wise to do so.

55 00:02:27.540 --> 00:02:32.540 So, I might get onto those questions a little bit later on,

56 00:02:32.730 --> 00:02:34.950 and that might be more interesting

57 00:02:34.950 --> 00:02:38.888 for those who are on the more activist side,

58 00:02:38.888 --> 00:02:41.038 which I did see some extinction value signs

59 00:02:42.824 --> 00:02:44.850 and so on in the amongst you.

60 00:02:44.850 --> 00:02:48.990 But if we first sort of address the question of ethics,

61 00:02:48.990 --> 00:02:53.990 then you can see the most kind of stringent version of that,

62 00:02:54.270 --> 00:02:58.561 of literature that looks at whether we should break the law

63 00:02:58.561 --> 00:03:01.111 when it's okay to break the law as part of protest.

64 00:03:02.127 --> 00:03:02.960 It comes from John Rawls

65 00:03:02.960 --> 00:03:04.470 And John Rawls really wrote, you know,

66 00:03:04.470 --> 00:03:07.384 in the early seventies, late sixties about this

67 00:03:07.384 --> 00:03:12.120 and he was part of a set of literature

68 00:03:12.120 --> 00:03:14.850 that grew around the US Civil Rights movement

69 00:03:14.850 --> 00:03:19.850 that was kind of there to justify that movement.

70 00:03:20.248 --> 00:03:24.630 But and in a way that would kind of make it,

71 00:03:24.630 --> 00:03:27.450 I suppose, appeal to a broader audience,

72 00:03:27.450 --> 00:03:29.040 then try to figure out when is it,

73 00:03:29.040 --> 00:03:33.150 when is it okay to break the law as part of protest?

74 00:03:33.150 --> 00:03:36.090 And he wasn't obviously

75 00:03:36.090 --> 00:03:38.070 the first person to write about civil disobedience,

76 00:03:38.070 --> 00:03:41.280 but he certainly has been the most important one

77 00:03:41.280 --> 00:03:44.610 and the one that has lasted, you know,

78 00:03:44.610 --> 00:03:47.550 it's almost anybody who works on civil disobedience

79 00:03:47.550 --> 00:03:51.930 has to relate themselves to Rawls in one way or another.

80 00:03:51.930 --> 00:03:54.207 Obviously, a lot of you work on ethics,

81 00:03:54.207 --> 00:03:58.710 so you will no doubt be familiar with Rawls' other writings,

82 00:03:58.710 --> 00:04:00.600 but about civil disobedience.

83 00:04:00.600 --> 00:04:02.850 I mean, he defines it as a public, non-violent,

84 00:04:02.850 --> 00:04:04.290 non-violent conscientious,

85 00:04:04.290 --> 00:04:06.540 yet political act contrary to law,

86 00:04:06.540 --> 00:04:08.730 but usually done with aim of bringing about

87 00:04:08.730 --> 00:04:12.090 a change in the law or policies of the government.

88 00:04:12.090 --> 00:04:16.380 So as such, it is a very kind of liberal framing.

89 00:04:16.380 --> 00:04:19.352 Obviously, you know, Rawls is a liberal theorist,

90 00:04:19.352 --> 00:04:23.269 and it is quite reformist in that sense.

91 00:04:23.269 --> 00:04:26.670 And famously the whole "Theory of Justice"

92 00:04:26.670 --> 00:04:29.430 is written about nearly perfect,

93 00:04:29.430 --> 00:04:31.140 I can't remember the cover he uses,

94 00:04:31.140 --> 00:04:35.828 but a nearly just democratic society.

95 00:04:35.828 --> 00:04:40.241 And a lot of what he's saying is about

96 00:04:40.241 --> 00:04:44.070 framing civil disobedience as something

97 00:04:44.070 --> 00:04:45.540 that is legitimate to do.

98 00:04:45.540 --> 00:04:48.390 And maintaining that legitimacy

99 00:04:48.390 --> 00:04:52.320 is what what is kind of theorizing is all about.

100 00:04:52.320 --> 00:04:55.200 And I think there's two aspects particularly

101 00:04:55.200 --> 00:04:57.597 that are really important in Rawls

102 00:04:57.597 --> 00:05:01.269 and that are really important to see how

103 00:05:01.269 --> 00:05:06.269 that movements today always have to kind of relate to.

104 00:05:06.824 --> 00:05:11.700 And those are the last resort and fidelity to law.

105 00:05:11.700 --> 00:05:15.420 And it is to show that if you're going to break the law,  
106 00:05:15.420 --> 00:05:17.700 if you're gonna annoy people, if you're gonna sit in a road,  
107 00:05:17.700 --> 00:05:22.700 if you're gonna do, you know, even slightly less nonviolent,  
108 00:05:23.640 --> 00:05:26.088 if you're gonna break windows or do something  
109 00:05:26.088 --> 00:05:28.580 that is outside of the law  
110 00:05:28.580 --> 00:05:33.540 that's gonna annoy people or people who own property,  
111 00:05:33.540 --> 00:05:36.487 then you need to show that doing so  
112 00:05:36.487 --> 00:05:41.144 is a last resort that he exhausted  
113 00:05:41.144 --> 00:05:44.041 and he defines it as exhausting other means  
114 00:05:44.041 --> 00:05:45.300 of doing what you want.  
115 00:05:45.300 --> 00:05:48.570 But I think for the climate change question,  
116 00:05:48.570 --> 00:05:50.970 this last resort takes on another meaning, right?  
117 00:05:50.970 --> 00:05:53.550 Like, we know that this is, you know,  
118 00:05:53.550 --> 00:05:56.280 time is running out out there,  
119 00:05:56.280 --> 00:05:58.860 and we are heading in the wrong direction.  
120 00:05:58.860 --> 00:06:03.090 You know, emissions are not decreasing, they are increasing.  
121 00:06:03.090 --> 00:06:08.090 And we know that we are up against time  
122 00:06:08.670 --> 00:06:11.850 in saving what we can save.  
123 00:06:11.850 --> 00:06:15.240 So in that sense, the discourses of a lot of these movements  
124 00:06:15.240 --> 00:06:17.272 that practice civil disobedience  
125 00:06:17.272 --> 00:06:20.808 for action against climate change,  
126 00:06:20.808 --> 00:06:24.845 obviously draw very heavily on this kind of last resort  
127 00:06:24.845 --> 00:06:27.779 that it is and credibly so.  
128 00:06:27.779 --> 00:06:29.250 I think that it's very difficult.  
129 00:06:29.250 --> 00:06:34.250 Well, it's difficult to contradict people

130 00:06:36.390 --> 00:06:39.782 who say that it is a last resort,  
131 00:06:39.782 --> 00:06:43.830 and then you have the fidelity to law.  
132 00:06:43.830 --> 00:06:46.500 So it says that not only does it need to be last resort,  
133 00:06:46.500 --> 00:06:50.130 but we need to do to practice civil disobedience  
134 00:06:50.130 --> 00:06:52.920 within an overall fidelity to law.  
135 00:06:52.920 --> 00:06:55.380 And that's what really sort of emphasized  
136 00:06:55.380 --> 00:06:57.870 the kind of liberal aspects of this as, you know,  
137 00:06:57.870 --> 00:06:59.940 it's reformist, it's within the state,  
138 00:06:59.940 --> 00:07:02.040 it's within the system as it is.  
139 00:07:02.040 --> 00:07:05.784 It's not something that tries to revolutionize the system  
140 00:07:05.784 --> 00:07:09.920 and what that the obligations that then get put on  
141 00:07:09.920 --> 00:07:11.970 to the practitioners of civil disobedience  
142 00:07:11.970 --> 00:07:13.800 is that it needs to be done in the open.  
143 00:07:13.800 --> 00:07:16.650 It needs to be done in a kind of conscientious way.  
144 00:07:16.650 --> 00:07:19.048 You cannot be masked when you do it,  
145 00:07:19.048 --> 00:07:21.458 and you need to accept the legal consequences  
146 00:07:21.458 --> 00:07:23.700 of what you do.  
147 00:07:23.700 --> 00:07:27.111 And I think that's very much along the lines  
148 00:07:27.111 --> 00:07:30.288 of the kind of disobedience that Extinction Rebellion  
149 00:07:30.288 --> 00:07:32.700 started practicing in the UK  
150 00:07:32.700 --> 00:07:35.160 and that also that the groups that have come out  
151 00:07:35.160 --> 00:07:37.912 of Extinction Rebellion and you know,  
152 00:07:37.912 --> 00:07:39.540 so Just Stop Oil and Insulate Britain  
153 00:07:39.540 --> 00:07:42.008 and all the other groups in,  
154 00:07:42.008 --> 00:07:45.150 well, around Europe, particularly  
155 00:07:45.150 --> 00:07:47.530 that have emerged in different countries  
156 00:07:48.424 --> 00:07:51.941 right now do practice it in

157 00:07:51.941 --> 00:07:56.008 that kind of open and conscientious way.  
 158 00:07:56.008 --> 00:07:57.480 But that's fidelity to law,  
 159 00:07:57.480 --> 00:07:59.940 that kind of arrest focus and you know,  
 160 00:07:59.940 --> 00:08:03.210 like this imagery of being carried away  
 161 00:08:03.210 --> 00:08:05.610 and facing the course of the law  
 162 00:08:05.610 --> 00:08:08.801 also means a kind of sacrifice.  
 163 00:08:08.801 --> 00:08:13.470 And that has been important for legitimacy,  
 right?  
 164 00:08:13.470 --> 00:08:18.360 So because the people that are involved in  
 these movements  
 165 00:08:18.360 --> 00:08:21.384 seldom are the ones that are hardest hit  
 166 00:08:21.384 --> 00:08:25.200 by climate change in here and now, right?  
 167 00:08:25.200 --> 00:08:28.410 We know the membership of these groups  
 168 00:08:28.410 --> 00:08:31.020 tend to be quite well educated,  
 169 00:08:31.020 --> 00:08:35.493 tend to be quite white and tends to be quite  
 middle class,  
 170 00:08:36.448 --> 00:08:38.910 so are not at the brunt  
 171 00:08:38.910 --> 00:08:41.790 of climate change in the here and now.  
 172 00:08:41.790 --> 00:08:44.584 Therefore, because they are not the ones  
 173 00:08:44.584 --> 00:08:47.850 that are worse affected by the problem,  
 174 00:08:47.850 --> 00:08:50.970 they kind of need to show a level of sacrifice  
 175 00:08:50.970 --> 00:08:54.360 in order to be listened to,  
 176 00:08:54.360 --> 00:08:58.080 in order to be kind of legitimate voices in this.  
 177 00:08:58.080 --> 00:09:03.080 Now we then, you know, if that was what kind  
 of,  
 178 00:09:03.362 --> 00:09:06.210 if fidelity to law and last resort  
 179 00:09:06.210 --> 00:09:08.632 was kind of the Rawlsian one  
 180 00:09:08.632 --> 00:09:10.530 and understand that was a very stringent view  
 181 00:09:10.530 --> 00:09:13.920 of when it's okay to use civil disobedience.  
 182 00:09:13.920 --> 00:09:15.960 Then the kind of political theory literature  
 183 00:09:15.960 --> 00:09:19.233 about civil disobedience has moved a long way  
 since then.

184 00:09:20.088 --> 00:09:25.088 And this is one, the picture book is a recent edited book

185 00:09:26.504 --> 00:09:29.808 that takes up a lot of different aspects there.

186 00:09:29.808 --> 00:09:30.900 Where will the kind of current,

187 00:09:30.900 --> 00:09:34.290 a lot of the current big writers about civil disobedience

188 00:09:34.290 --> 00:09:37.980 in general or have written chapters.

189 00:09:37.980 --> 00:09:41.040 So what some of the points that they raised

190 00:09:41.040 --> 00:09:42.600 kind of against rules is that,

191 00:09:42.600 --> 00:09:45.210 well, we don't live in a nearly just society.

192 00:09:45.210 --> 00:09:48.960 So a lot of what Rawls says can't really be taken.

193 00:09:48.960 --> 00:09:52.110 You know, his kind of quite limited perspective

194 00:09:52.110 --> 00:09:54.240 of when it's okay to break the law

195 00:09:54.240 --> 00:09:55.830 can't really be taken that seriously

196 00:09:55.830 --> 00:09:57.270 or we can't be limited by that

197 00:09:57.270 --> 00:09:59.670 because we don't live in the nearly just society

198 00:09:59.670 --> 00:10:02.403 that Rawls presumes.

199 00:10:03.840 --> 00:10:05.670 So instead they, you know,

200 00:10:05.670 --> 00:10:07.140 a lot of these author ask about,

201 00:10:07.140 --> 00:10:10.710 well, what are our political obligations to whom?

202 00:10:10.710 --> 00:10:13.110 And you know, obviously with that

203 00:10:13.110 --> 00:10:16.419 they don't accept a kind of limited view of,

204 00:10:16.419 --> 00:10:19.002 you know, that you have to follow the law, right?

205 00:10:19.002 --> 00:10:24.002 But ask when, under what circumstances

206 00:10:24.030 --> 00:10:25.352 do we need to follow the law?

207 00:10:25.352 --> 00:10:30.060 And who do we owe political obligations to?

208 00:10:30.060 --> 00:10:32.070 And when you look at the way that, for example,

209 00:10:32.070 --> 00:10:33.600 Extinction Rebellion frame this,

210 00:10:33.600 --> 00:10:34.920 you know, they frame it around



211 00:10:34.920 --> 00:10:36.720 kind of having a social contract  
 212 00:10:36.720 --> 00:10:39.330 that has been broken by the states and so on.  
 213 00:10:39.330 --> 00:10:40.163 And then you can ask,  
 214 00:10:40.163 --> 00:10:42.750 did we ever have the kind of social contract  
 215 00:10:42.750 --> 00:10:46.448 is also quite a liberal kind of theory.  
 216 00:10:46.448 --> 00:10:50.070 So was there ever a social contract?  
 217 00:10:50.070 --> 00:10:53.400 And if so has it been broken?  
 218 00:10:53.400 --> 00:10:57.210 But that kind of language of social contract  
 219 00:10:57.210 --> 00:11:00.000 is one that we see Extinction Rebellion particularly  
 220 00:11:00.000 --> 00:11:02.400 uses quite a lot.  
 221 00:11:02.400 --> 00:11:06.690 And one aspect from this literature also that comes up is,  
 222 00:11:06.690 --> 00:11:09.120 does disobedience have to be civil?  
 223 00:11:09.120 --> 00:11:11.250 So what do we mean by civil?  
 224 00:11:11.250 --> 00:11:13.860 Well, civil tends to mean nonviolent.  
 225 00:11:13.860 --> 00:11:15.480 And then where do we draw the line  
 226 00:11:15.480 --> 00:11:19.032 of what's violent and nonviolent?  
 227 00:11:19.032 --> 00:11:24.032 And there's others for example,  
 228 00:11:24.840 --> 00:11:28.530 throwing soup at a Van Gogh painting would presumably not,  
 229 00:11:28.530 --> 00:11:30.390 it's not necessarily violent,  
 230 00:11:30.390 --> 00:11:34.380 but would probably be seen as non civil as in, you know,  
 231 00:11:34.380 --> 00:11:38.160 it's not just about displaying your,  
 232 00:11:38.160 --> 00:11:39.690 kind of like you are after  
 233 00:11:39.690 --> 00:11:43.320 the kind of shock element if you do that,  
 234 00:11:43.320 --> 00:11:47.970 which would probably be seen as uncivil by many.  
 235 00:11:47.970 --> 00:11:51.390 So under what circumstances do you have to keep  
 236 00:11:51.390 --> 00:11:54.303 to those kind of rules of civility?

237 00:11:56.520 --> 00:12:00.150 Now the other kind of set of political theory literature

238 00:12:00.150 --> 00:12:02.190 that looks at the ethics,

239 00:12:02.190 --> 00:12:05.790 particularly of civil disobedience is anarchist literature.

240 00:12:05.790 --> 00:12:09.780 And I mean, since I started studying these things,

241 00:12:09.780 --> 00:12:13.170 I have become much more of an anarchist myself.

242 00:12:13.170 --> 00:12:14.190 I'm not an anarchist,

243 00:12:14.190 --> 00:12:18.660 but I learned much more about anarchism

244 00:12:18.660 --> 00:12:21.453 and the kind of values and so on that it was,

245 00:12:22.610 --> 00:12:26.100 and it is actually quite interesting literature to get into.

246 00:12:26.100 --> 00:12:31.100 It's obviously something that is very far out there

247 00:12:31.500 --> 00:12:36.500 in terms of most academic literature.

248 00:12:37.170 --> 00:12:38.670 But it is definitely worthwhile

249 00:12:38.670 --> 00:12:40.170 when you ask questions about

250 00:12:40.170 --> 00:12:42.750 should we break the law to save the world?

251 00:12:42.750 --> 00:12:45.093 Anarchism certainly has a lot to say about it.

252 00:12:46.157 --> 00:12:48.480 And what anarchists' literature says is that,

253 00:12:48.480 --> 00:12:52.140 well, what they don't talk about civil disobedience,

254 00:12:52.140 --> 00:12:54.330 they talk about direct action.

255 00:12:54.330 --> 00:12:57.693 And direct action doesn't necessarily have to be illegal,

256 00:12:58.830 --> 00:13:02.490 and it doesn't necessarily have to be nonviolent either,

257 00:13:02.490 --> 00:13:06.090 but what it should be always, it's prefigurative.

258 00:13:06.090 --> 00:13:07.800 So what does that mean?

259 00:13:07.800 --> 00:13:10.773 Well, that means prefigurative is kind of when you try to,

260 00:13:12.240 --> 00:13:16.014 is when the means and the ends are congruent.  
261 00:13:16.014 --> 00:13:19.590 So you should be trying to create the future  
262 00:13:19.590 --> 00:13:23.043 that you want on a smaller scale here and  
now.  
263 00:13:24.120 --> 00:13:27.030 So these kind of prefigurative values were very  
strong,  
264 00:13:27.030 --> 00:13:29.073 for example, in the Occupy movement.  
265 00:13:30.000 --> 00:13:32.280 And it's about, you know, how do we relate  
to each other?  
266 00:13:32.280 --> 00:13:35.220 How do we make decisions and that that  
should be in a way  
267 00:13:35.220 --> 00:13:37.357 that is in the kind of society  
268 00:13:37.357 --> 00:13:39.753 that we would like in the future.  
269 00:13:41.400 --> 00:13:42.990 And I don't know if any of you  
270 00:13:42.990 --> 00:13:44.460 have been watching "The Last of Us,"  
271 00:13:44.460 --> 00:13:46.320 for example, lately on TV.  
272 00:13:46.320 --> 00:13:48.063 It's a big, it's a big deal here.  
273 00:13:49.437 --> 00:13:51.537 But what I would see as the kind of,  
274 00:13:51.537 --> 00:13:56.537 for me, anarchist socialist community that  
they have  
275 00:13:56.610 --> 00:14:00.360 in a kind of one of the apocalyptic scenarios,  
276 00:14:00.360 --> 00:14:04.320 there would certainly be a kind of figurative  
way  
277 00:14:04.320 --> 00:14:06.030 of organizing society.  
278 00:14:06.030 --> 00:14:08.970 What it means with,  
279 00:14:08.970 --> 00:14:11.060 in terms of civil disobedience  
280 00:14:11.060 --> 00:14:15.480 is then that what you do should not be just  
symbolic.  
281 00:14:15.480 --> 00:14:20.040 So throwing soup at a Van Gogh painting  
282 00:14:20.040 --> 00:14:21.960 would not be particularly prefigurative.  
283 00:14:21.960 --> 00:14:23.850 There is nothing that links  
284 00:14:23.850 --> 00:14:28.380 the action of wanting drastic action on climate  
change

285 00:14:28.380 --> 00:14:32.700 and having a painting that is a few hundred years old

286 00:14:32.700 --> 00:14:34.470 covered by soup, right?

287 00:14:34.470 --> 00:14:35.580 So there's nothing,

288 00:14:35.580 --> 00:14:40.580 so there's no congruency there

289 00:14:40.590 --> 00:14:42.480 between the means and the ends,

290 00:14:42.480 --> 00:14:46.770 nor necessarily is public disruption of the kind that,

291 00:14:46.770 --> 00:14:51.330 you know, you sit on a road somewhere if you, close up,

292 00:14:51.330 --> 00:14:54.150 you try to make a car free city central,

293 00:14:54.150 --> 00:14:55.320 so then you can argue that

294 00:14:55.320 --> 00:14:58.350 maybe that's a little bit more prefigurative

295 00:14:58.350 --> 00:14:59.490 because you're kind of trying

296 00:14:59.490 --> 00:15:03.037 to create a society without cars,

297 00:15:03.037 --> 00:15:05.597 but probably sitting on a motorway

298 00:15:05.597 --> 00:15:08.643 is not that prefigurative.

299 00:15:10.470 --> 00:15:12.180 So it should go beyond the symbolic

300 00:15:12.180 --> 00:15:14.220 and it should not be consequentialist.

301 00:15:14.220 --> 00:15:15.720 And you can argue that that's kind of

302 00:15:15.720 --> 00:15:18.000 when you sit on a motorway and well,

303 00:15:18.000 --> 00:15:20.760 when you are disrupting the public,

304 00:15:20.760 --> 00:15:23.820 you are doing so in order to get their attention, but you,

305 00:15:23.820 --> 00:15:27.300 it's not really the public that is your target.

306 00:15:27.300 --> 00:15:30.540 You're trying to do it or kind of to get media attention

307 00:15:30.540 --> 00:15:32.940 and or other kinds of attention.

308 00:15:32.940 --> 00:15:36.600 But you are doing it because you have this other gripe,

309 00:15:36.600 --> 00:15:38.610 this other thing, which is,

310 00:15:38.610 --> 00:15:40.743 you know, let's stop climate change.

311 00:15:41.580 --> 00:15:42.720 But that's then,

312 00:15:42.720 --> 00:15:45.600 because there is no connection between  
 313 00:15:45.600 --> 00:15:47.813 what you want and what you do,  
 314 00:15:47.813 --> 00:15:51.450 that becomes a kind of consequentialist act  
 as well.  
 315 00:15:51.450 --> 00:15:56.160 You're causing harm to some people in order  
 316 00:15:56.160 --> 00:15:59.880 because you have this other bigger more im-  
 portant thing  
 317 00:15:59.880 --> 00:16:01.350 that you want to claim.  
 318 00:16:01.350 --> 00:16:04.181 But so that would not be according  
 319 00:16:04.181 --> 00:16:07.290 to kind of anarchist ethics,  
 320 00:16:07.290 --> 00:16:10.380 which ought to be prefigurative.  
 321 00:16:10.380 --> 00:16:14.970 Now there are, so what would be prefigurative  
 then?  
 322 00:16:14.970 --> 00:16:18.240 Well, it would be prefigurative to stop,  
 323 00:16:18.240 --> 00:16:20.490 you know, block oil refineries for example,  
 324 00:16:20.490 --> 00:16:23.813 which is also something that the climate move-  
 ment have done.  
 325 00:16:23.813 --> 00:16:28.260 It would be prefigurative to block airports,  
 326 00:16:28.260 --> 00:16:31.140 particularly these airports that are used  
 327 00:16:31.140 --> 00:16:34.080 by private jets and so on, right?  
 328 00:16:34.080 --> 00:16:35.370 Which is also a practice  
 329 00:16:35.370 --> 00:16:38.047 that some of these movements have done.  
 330 00:16:38.047 --> 00:16:39.840 So those kind of actions that are more tar-  
 geted,  
 331 00:16:39.840 --> 00:16:43.590 well, they target things that are simply in-  
 compatible  
 332 00:16:43.590 --> 00:16:47.910 with a sustainable, an ecologically sustainable  
 world.  
 333 00:16:47.910 --> 00:16:50.293 So those kind of actions would be  
 334 00:16:50.293 --> 00:16:53.250 prefigurative in a different way.  
 335 00:16:53.250 --> 00:16:56.223 So those are kind of the different kind of  
 ethical,  
 336 00:16:57.690 --> 00:16:58.650 well, reasons why,

337 00:16:58.650 --> 00:17:00.660 you know, ethics to follow.

338 00:17:00.660 --> 00:17:04.394 Then when we get into the more political we can ask,

339 00:17:04.394 --> 00:17:06.630 why should we disobey the law?

340 00:17:06.630 --> 00:17:10.950 So why is breaking the law to save the world

341 00:17:10.950 --> 00:17:14.933 even something that is worth considering politically?

342 00:17:14.933 --> 00:17:17.670 So then what it achieves

343 00:17:17.670 --> 00:17:21.750 and what obviously the most kind of famous examples of this

344 00:17:21.750 --> 00:17:24.420 in recent year achieve is media attention, right?

345 00:17:24.420 --> 00:17:29.400 It gets media attention to an issue or to a group.

346 00:17:29.400 --> 00:17:30.928 And then you must always ask,

347 00:17:30.928 --> 00:17:33.110 to what purpose do you do that?

348 00:17:33.110 --> 00:17:36.213 To what purpose do you get that media attention?

349 00:17:37.997 --> 00:17:39.900 And what some of these later groups

350 00:17:39.900 --> 00:17:43.770 then have realized is that, okay, well, if we have a name

351 00:17:43.770 --> 00:17:45.960 that gets mentioned every time in the media

352 00:17:45.960 --> 00:17:50.190 like Insulate Britain or like Just Stop Oil

353 00:17:50.190 --> 00:17:52.397 less so maybe with Just Stop Oil, but still,

354 00:17:52.397 --> 00:17:57.397 or as various groups around Europe as well do,

355 00:17:58.797 --> 00:18:02.190 then every time you get mentioned in the media, you kind of,

356 00:18:02.190 --> 00:18:05.700 it's obvious you can politicize an issue, you can get,

357 00:18:05.700 --> 00:18:10.700 you can raise the profile of a certain issue in a way that,

358 00:18:11.100 --> 00:18:14.130 for example, Extinction Rebellion didn't necessarily do,

359 00:18:14.130 --> 00:18:18.960 although they did certainly in Britain

360 00:18:18.960 --> 00:18:22.720 when they first kind of became famous in April, 2019

361 00:18:23.580 --> 00:18:27.000 with their occupation of Central London.

362 00:18:27.000 --> 00:18:30.357 They did achieve a lot of attention towards climate change

363 00:18:30.357 --> 00:18:32.751 and they did change public opinion

364 00:18:32.751 --> 00:18:37.751 quite drastically on climate change and that has lasted.

365 00:18:41.190 --> 00:18:43.410 So that kind of media attention

366 00:18:43.410 --> 00:18:45.840 can obviously serve a purpose.

367 00:18:45.840 --> 00:18:48.210 It doesn't necessarily serve a purpose.

368 00:18:48.210 --> 00:18:50.520 So it's important that it doesn't,

369 00:18:50.520 --> 00:18:52.890 that all the talk isn't about the action

370 00:18:52.890 --> 00:18:55.680 that you get to talk about the issue

371 00:18:55.680 --> 00:18:57.570 and the responsibility to do that

372 00:18:57.570 --> 00:19:00.660 doesn't just lie with the movement themselves.

373 00:19:00.660 --> 00:19:04.050 It lies with people like me and other experts

374 00:19:04.050 --> 00:19:06.660 who get to talk in the media

375 00:19:06.660 --> 00:19:11.356 as a result of actions that people do.

376 00:19:11.356 --> 00:19:16.356 So, you know, if when I get interviewed about things,

377 00:19:17.490 --> 00:19:20.310 about Van Gogh paintings and so on, you know,

378 00:19:20.310 --> 00:19:23.850 it's important that I bring the conversation

379 00:19:23.850 --> 00:19:25.890 back to what it should be about,

380 00:19:25.890 --> 00:19:30.014 which is, in the case of that with just stopping oil,

381 00:19:30.014 --> 00:19:33.720 which is about renewing this oil,

382 00:19:33.720 --> 00:19:36.600 like give new oil lines a hundred new licenses

383 00:19:36.600 --> 00:19:40.173 to export oil and gas in the UK.

384 00:19:41.550 --> 00:19:45.690 So that kind of using that media attention

385 00:19:45.690 --> 00:19:47.430 is obviously important.

386 00:19:47.430 --> 00:19:51.750 It's not obvious that the media attention is a good thing.

387 00:19:51.750 --> 00:19:55.381 It's also exaggerated those that say that it's a bad thing.

388 00:19:55.381 --> 00:19:57.390 It's like, and this is something that I'm actually

389 00:19:57.390 --> 00:20:00.573 starting to do quite a lot of research into now,

390 00:20:01.500 --> 00:20:02.670 really trying to see

391 00:20:02.670 --> 00:20:07.290 the public opinion effects of unpopular protests,

392 00:20:07.290 --> 00:20:09.855 which if you look at opinion polls are actually,

393 00:20:09.855 --> 00:20:12.431 there's really very little evidence to say

394 00:20:12.431 --> 00:20:16.916 that unpopular protests are counterproductive

395 00:20:16.916 --> 00:20:20.280 for the movement as a whole.

396 00:20:20.280 --> 00:20:21.420 This it's,

397 00:20:25.431 --> 00:20:28.320 people don't really stop,

398 00:20:28.320 --> 00:20:30.840 people don't think that we should burn the planet

399 00:20:30.840 --> 00:20:34.083 because they get annoyed of people sitting in the road.

400 00:20:35.130 --> 00:20:38.070 There's little evidence to suggest that

401 00:20:38.070 --> 00:20:40.860 although there is one group in society,

402 00:20:40.860 --> 00:20:45.000 it seems it gets a little bit more militant against it,

403 00:20:45.000 --> 00:20:46.770 but largely that's not what happens.

404 00:20:46.770 --> 00:20:50.317 But that doesn't mean that all attention is good attention.

405 00:20:50.317 --> 00:20:52.800 Like you need to know what you want to do

406 00:20:52.800 --> 00:20:55.150 with the attention that you get from the media.

407 00:20:56.940 --> 00:20:58.650 So you can ask that for what purpose.

408 00:20:58.650 --> 00:21:01.770 And then a deeper question there is,

409 00:21:01.770 --> 00:21:04.893 well, what is the role of public opinion?



410 00:21:05.730 --> 00:21:08.490 Are you trying to recruit people to the movement?

411 00:21:08.490 --> 00:21:10.830 Are you trying to just let people know

412 00:21:10.830 --> 00:21:12.960 that climate change is real

413 00:21:12.960 --> 00:21:16.397 and it's a threat and that it gets talked about?

414 00:21:16.397 --> 00:21:17.850 And if it is the latter,

415 00:21:17.850 --> 00:21:20.901 then in the UK and in most of Europe,

416 00:21:20.901 --> 00:21:23.760 that has already been kind of achieved,

417 00:21:23.760 --> 00:21:28.757 like climate change denialism is a very small phenomenon.

418 00:21:28.757 --> 00:21:32.490 People on the large know that climate change is real

419 00:21:32.490 --> 00:21:36.780 and know that it's threat, how big a threat it is.

420 00:21:36.780 --> 00:21:37.830 They might not, you know,

421 00:21:37.830 --> 00:21:38.940 if you ask the general public,

422 00:21:38.940 --> 00:21:43.217 you probably don't get as accurate answers.

423 00:21:43.217 --> 00:21:47.310 But getting climate change just talked about

424 00:21:47.310 --> 00:21:48.960 isn't necessarily the win

425 00:21:48.960 --> 00:21:52.837 that it maybe was 10 or 20 years ago.

426 00:21:52.837 --> 00:21:54.990 Not in the UK or in Europe.

427 00:21:54.990 --> 00:21:57.300 I don't want to speak on behalf of the US

428 00:21:57.300 --> 00:22:00.037 because I know that obviously in the US,

429 00:22:00.037 --> 00:22:03.240 well, climate change denialism has been

430 00:22:03.240 --> 00:22:06.390 a much, much bigger, bigger problem.

431 00:22:06.390 --> 00:22:09.300 And you have certainly powerful political forces

432 00:22:09.300 --> 00:22:12.180 that deny climate change in a way in the US

433 00:22:12.180 --> 00:22:15.513 that we don't necessarily have on this side of the Atlantic.

434 00:22:17.340 --> 00:22:20.847 But anyway, it's not obvious that

435 00:22:20.847 --> 00:22:23.490 what you want public opinion about,

436 00:22:23.490 --> 00:22:27.360 like is it's important just simply getting it,

437 00:22:27.360 --> 00:22:28.620 just getting the attention  
438 00:22:28.620 --> 00:22:32.928 isn't necessarily going to achieve very much.  
439 00:22:32.928 --> 00:22:37.928 So another reason that it's these movements  
use disobedience  
440 00:22:39.510 --> 00:22:42.210 and break the law is to create a kind of tension  
441 00:22:42.210 --> 00:22:45.630 and polarization in society where,  
442 00:22:45.630 --> 00:22:48.590 so that issues can get sort of politicized.  
443 00:22:48.590 --> 00:22:53.590 So you know that you're gonna anger a lot of  
people and you,  
444 00:22:54.357 --> 00:22:56.730 but you try to use that anger  
445 00:22:56.730 --> 00:22:59.130 to kind of politicize the issues  
446 00:22:59.130 --> 00:23:02.194 that you want to get politicized.  
447 00:23:02.194 --> 00:23:06.930 And that polarization has been largely suc-  
cessful.  
448 00:23:06.930 --> 00:23:10.740 So, you know, you now see in opinion polls  
449 00:23:10.740 --> 00:23:15.740 that people who are concerned about climate  
change  
450 00:23:15.776 --> 00:23:19.200 are much more likely to be supportive  
451 00:23:19.200 --> 00:23:22.230 of groups that do this.  
452 00:23:22.230 --> 00:23:24.870 What you haven't seen is loads of people  
453 00:23:24.870 --> 00:23:27.000 joining civil disobedience movements, right?  
454 00:23:27.000 --> 00:23:29.550 So these movements are still made up  
455 00:23:29.550 --> 00:23:32.023 by really, really quite, you know,  
456 00:23:32.023 --> 00:23:33.960 a small section of society.  
457 00:23:33.960 --> 00:23:36.450 So although you have about 10% of people  
saying that,  
458 00:23:36.450 --> 00:23:39.120 oh, I would do civil disobedience for climate  
change,  
459 00:23:39.120 --> 00:23:41.220 the actual number that are involved  
460 00:23:41.220 --> 00:23:44.583 is obviously much, much smaller.  
461 00:23:45.510 --> 00:23:50.510 One of the key reasons why to engage in direct  
action

462 00:23:50.970 --> 00:23:54.990 or civil disobedience is that it can get direct results.

463 00:23:54.990 --> 00:23:59.833 Now the chance of getting direct results is much greater

464 00:24:01.080 --> 00:24:04.560 if your target is closer to home.

465 00:24:04.560 --> 00:24:09.420 So obviously if your demand is to save the world

466 00:24:10.741 --> 00:24:15.300 and then no actor that you're protesting against

467 00:24:15.300 --> 00:24:17.010 is going to be able to do that,

468 00:24:17.010 --> 00:24:19.320 if your target is to

469 00:24:19.320 --> 00:24:21.420 even stop the government to doing something,

470 00:24:21.420 --> 00:24:23.880 then it's gonna be difficult to do that.

471 00:24:23.880 --> 00:24:26.670 Whereas if your target is to stop your university

472 00:24:26.670 --> 00:24:29.850 investing in oil and gas, for example,

473 00:24:29.850 --> 00:24:32.476 that's a much more achievable target

474 00:24:32.476 --> 00:24:37.476 to actually get results if you do civil disobedience.

475 00:24:39.030 --> 00:24:42.300 And indeed we have seen such civil disobedience work

476 00:24:42.300 --> 00:24:47.300 in many universities around the world, right?

477 00:24:47.880 --> 00:24:52.880 So that has to do with what kind of demands you put

478 00:24:52.933 --> 00:24:57.840 but you can get direct results through civil disobedience,

479 00:24:57.840 --> 00:24:59.580 through direct action in a way

480 00:24:59.580 --> 00:25:03.750 that you would never do with other kinds of protest

481 00:25:03.750 --> 00:25:05.040 and which you can achieve

482 00:25:05.040 --> 00:25:10.040 with quite small numbers of people, of course,

483 00:25:10.920 --> 00:25:13.410 also that goes for media attention as well.

484 00:25:13.410 --> 00:25:15.630 You can get much more space in the media

485 00:25:15.630 --> 00:25:17.880 with much smaller numbers of people

486 00:25:17.880 --> 00:25:20.280 when you do disobedient protests.  
487 00:25:20.280 --> 00:25:22.710 And in a way that's what appeals to me  
488 00:25:22.710 --> 00:25:26.160 with disobedient protests and why I'm so  
interested in it  
489 00:25:26.160 --> 00:25:27.840 because I can see, you know,  
490 00:25:27.840 --> 00:25:31.230 that it has shaped quite a lot of political life  
491 00:25:31.230 --> 00:25:35.277 and political discussion around number of  
issues  
492 00:25:35.277 --> 00:25:39.728 with much smaller amounts of people  
493 00:25:39.728 --> 00:25:43.530 than have been involved in other kinds of  
protests.  
494 00:25:43.530 --> 00:25:45.060 So then to kind of,  
495 00:25:45.060 --> 00:25:46.830 obviously I've touched on this, but you know,  
496 00:25:46.830 --> 00:25:47.850 what makes it work?  
497 00:25:47.850 --> 00:25:51.630 Well, having achievable demands works, right?  
498 00:25:51.630 --> 00:25:54.000 If you have demands that the actors  
499 00:25:54.000 --> 00:25:59.000 that you are protesting against can do some-  
thing about,  
500 00:25:59.072 --> 00:26:01.080 can put into place,  
501 00:26:01.080 --> 00:26:05.043 then you are much more likely to achieve  
something.  
502 00:26:05.910 --> 00:26:08.030 So achievable demands but,  
503 00:26:08.030 --> 00:26:13.030 and that's not to say that we shouldn't aim  
big,  
504 00:26:13.470 --> 00:26:16.650 of course we should, but then that's,  
505 00:26:16.650 --> 00:26:19.472 you know, you're not gonna necessarily get,  
506 00:26:19.472 --> 00:26:23.580 each protest won't have the same results.  
507 00:26:23.580 --> 00:26:25.320 And what we also have to remember  
508 00:26:25.320 --> 00:26:29.130 is that these protests come at great personal  
risk  
509 00:26:29.130 --> 00:26:31.053 to the people who carry them out.  
510 00:26:33.300 --> 00:26:37.680 Targets, so who are we targeting with our  
protests?

511 00:26:37.680 --> 00:26:40.767 So if we target the general public,  
512 00:26:40.767 --> 00:26:43.890 what's the reason for doing that?  
513 00:26:43.890 --> 00:26:46.337 And you know, what do we,  
514 00:26:46.337 --> 00:26:50.250 that's the only reason for targeting the general  
public,  
515 00:26:50.250 --> 00:26:54.150 I think would be to achieve space in the media.  
516 00:26:54.150 --> 00:26:56.070 So then you have to really make sure  
517 00:26:56.070 --> 00:26:58.920 that you use that in the right way.  
518 00:26:58.920 --> 00:27:00.540 So Extinction Rebellion, for example,  
519 00:27:00.540 --> 00:27:02.310 have now said that they will no longer  
520 00:27:02.310 --> 00:27:05.430 target the general public, right?  
521 00:27:05.430 --> 00:27:09.360 So that was part of their kind of when they  
declared  
522 00:27:09.360 --> 00:27:11.460 that we quit at the start of this year  
523 00:27:11.460 --> 00:27:12.990 wasn't actually we quit.  
524 00:27:12.990 --> 00:27:13.890 It was more of a,  
525 00:27:13.890 --> 00:27:16.560 well, we are no longer going to target the  
general public,  
526 00:27:16.560 --> 00:27:21.480 we're going to just have target specific emitters  
527 00:27:21.480 --> 00:27:24.900 or you know, the government and so on.  
528 00:27:24.900 --> 00:27:27.930 So obviously if you have a target,  
529 00:27:27.930 --> 00:27:29.580 then you need to do much less to,  
530 00:27:29.580 --> 00:27:30.930 if you have a logical target,  
531 00:27:30.930 --> 00:27:35.070 then you need to do much less to justify your  
protests,  
532 00:27:35.070 --> 00:27:38.340 but you also might not get the same attention.  
533 00:27:38.340 --> 00:27:39.810 So Just Stop Oil, for example,  
534 00:27:39.810 --> 00:27:42.630 was founded or started off with  
535 00:27:42.630 --> 00:27:45.180 attacking sort of the oil infrastructure,  
536 00:27:45.180 --> 00:27:46.957 but that's often, you know,  
537 00:27:46.957 --> 00:27:49.230 located far away from where the journalists  
hang out

538 00:27:49.230 --> 00:27:51.540 and far away from where there are a lot of people.

539 00:27:51.540 --> 00:27:55.080 So nobody really noticed, nobody took much notice of them.

540 00:27:55.080 --> 00:27:57.870 So although the target was much more logical

541 00:27:57.870 --> 00:28:00.581 from a stopping climate change perspective,

542 00:28:00.581 --> 00:28:02.700 they didn't achieve the same

543 00:28:02.700 --> 00:28:04.800 and that's why they kind of then reverted

544 00:28:04.800 --> 00:28:09.580 to do more kind of headline grabbing kind of actions.

545 00:28:11.520 --> 00:28:14.250 So whilst it's easier to justify,

546 00:28:14.250 --> 00:28:19.250 you might lose the attention that you get otherwise.

547 00:28:20.550 --> 00:28:24.270 But more than that, why, what makes it work?

548 00:28:24.270 --> 00:28:28.770 Well, what does the actions that these groups take,

549 00:28:28.770 --> 00:28:31.350 what do they say about the politics?

550 00:28:31.350 --> 00:28:36.350 What do the targets say about the politics of these groups?

551 00:28:37.253 --> 00:28:40.154 And they're, you know,

552 00:28:40.154 --> 00:28:45.154 so what we've seen a lot in the UK has been

553 00:28:45.300 --> 00:28:47.010 targeting of banks and so on.

554 00:28:47.010 --> 00:28:50.197 So how clear does that kind of messaging becomes of like,

555 00:28:50.197 --> 00:28:53.340 what's the role of the sort of banking sector,

556 00:28:53.340 --> 00:28:55.613 for example, in that?

557 00:28:55.613 --> 00:28:59.733 So when we see sort of Just Stop Oil

558 00:28:59.733 --> 00:29:04.157 in the most recent kind of wave was,

559 00:29:04.157 --> 00:29:08.127 or protest or also targeted, you know,

560 00:29:08.127 --> 00:29:12.480 for example, luxury car dealerships and so on.

561 00:29:12.480 --> 00:29:13.740 And there you can see.

562 00:29:13.740 --> 00:29:17.160 So although, and as a critical political economist,

563 00:29:17.160 --> 00:29:19.876 I've often been frustrated with this.

564 00:29:19.876 --> 00:29:22.800 So I was frustrated with Extinction Rebellion in early days

565 00:29:22.800 --> 00:29:25.830 and being, you know, kind of not wanting to talk about,

566 00:29:25.830 --> 00:29:28.590 capitalism or whatever that kind of means

567 00:29:28.590 --> 00:29:30.330 because they didn't want to be labeled

568 00:29:30.330 --> 00:29:33.150 as a kind of left wing group.

569 00:29:33.150 --> 00:29:36.453 They wanted to have a kind of wider appeal.

570 00:29:37.470 --> 00:29:38.550 But more and more

571 00:29:38.550 --> 00:29:41.820 in the targets that these groups have chosen,

572 00:29:41.820 --> 00:29:44.100 it's clear that they take their aim

573 00:29:44.100 --> 00:29:46.890 at the way that the political economy works, right?

574 00:29:46.890 --> 00:29:50.328 So then that can be both kind of culturally

575 00:29:50.328 --> 00:29:51.990 through markers like luxury cars

576 00:29:51.990 --> 00:29:56.938 as a kind of marker of class

577 00:29:56.938 --> 00:30:01.938 and of a culture of high emission kind of culture

578 00:30:02.292 --> 00:30:04.260 or as we say, you know,

579 00:30:04.260 --> 00:30:06.373 against banks and obviously,

580 00:30:06.373 --> 00:30:10.740 of course, the fossil fuel industry themselves.

581 00:30:10.740 --> 00:30:14.700 So there we have seen I think a shift to targeting

582 00:30:14.700 --> 00:30:17.850 much more of, yeah,

583 00:30:17.850 --> 00:30:22.653 the forces to drive capitalism as it is, I suppose.

584 00:30:23.790 --> 00:30:28.790 Now where my kind of main critiques against this,

585 00:30:28.890 --> 00:30:30.967 these movements have gone

586 00:30:30.967 --> 00:30:34.260 is what I kind of see as Hallamism called,

587 00:30:34.260 --> 00:30:36.120 named after the co-founder

588 00:30:36.120 --> 00:30:38.913 of Extinction Rebellion, Roger Hallam.

589 00:30:40.109 --> 00:30:45.109 And it is this focus on arrests, arrests, arrests

590 00:30:46.770 --> 00:30:50.213 and this kind of, I suppose, glorifying arrests  
591 00:30:50.213 --> 00:30:55.020 because whilst getting arrested is always a risk  
592 00:30:55.020 --> 00:30:58.503 if you're engaged in activities that break the law,  
593 00:30:59.790 --> 00:31:04.260 making the arrest an aim in itself is something  
594 00:31:04.260 --> 00:31:08.902 that comes at really high cost for activists.  
595 00:31:08.902 --> 00:31:12.423 And it's also something that doesn't necessarily, you know,  
596 00:31:13.260 --> 00:31:16.140 when they launched Extinction Rebellion and so on,  
597 00:31:16.140 --> 00:31:18.060 they made a whole lot of claims about,  
598 00:31:18.060 --> 00:31:21.510 oh, this what we are doing is based on social science  
599 00:31:21.510 --> 00:31:23.430 and this is also a thing that they go,  
600 00:31:23.430 --> 00:31:25.050 like they say now with like,  
601 00:31:25.050 --> 00:31:27.090 with Just Stop Oil, for example,  
602 00:31:27.090 --> 00:31:29.850 which Hallam is also very deeply involved in.  
603 00:31:29.850 --> 00:31:34.050 And you know, like civil disobedience is going to save us,  
604 00:31:34.050 --> 00:31:36.120 you know, like it's our only hope.  
605 00:31:36.120 --> 00:31:37.890 Now I don't think it is.  
606 00:31:37.890 --> 00:31:40.800 I think that civil disobedience is really important  
607 00:31:40.800 --> 00:31:43.853 and it's something that is absolutely justifiable,  
608 00:31:43.853 --> 00:31:47.923 but putting all our hope to it,  
609 00:31:47.923 --> 00:31:52.560 I think is also a mistake to some extent.  
610 00:31:52.560 --> 00:31:55.590 But particularly this thing with getting arrested  
611 00:31:55.590 --> 00:31:58.653 is basically based on one episode  
612 00:31:58.653 --> 00:32:01.852 of this US Civil Rights movement  
613 00:32:01.852 --> 00:32:06.240 and he basically read something in a book and then said,



614 00:32:06.240 --> 00:32:07.967 well, this is what we have to do.  
615 00:32:07.967 --> 00:32:11.677 And it's taken it completely out of the context  
616 00:32:11.677 --> 00:32:14.370 in which it was carried out.  
617 00:32:14.370 --> 00:32:16.740 So this kind of all focus  
618 00:32:16.740 --> 00:32:19.590 and glorification of getting arrested  
619 00:32:19.590 --> 00:32:24.180 is something that I think wasn't very well  
thought through.  
620 00:32:24.180 --> 00:32:25.350 And that also, you know,  
621 00:32:25.350 --> 00:32:28.188 had some unfortunate political consequences  
622 00:32:28.188 --> 00:32:33.188 in the way that it often excludes many people  
623 00:32:33.540 --> 00:32:36.693 from engaging in the movement.  
624 00:32:37.560 --> 00:32:38.580 What we've also seen,  
625 00:32:38.580 --> 00:32:41.100 and this is obviously not Roger Hallam's  
626 00:32:41.100 --> 00:32:43.517 or anybody else's fault as such,  
627 00:32:43.517 --> 00:32:45.360 but we've obviously seen a big authoritarian  
backlash.  
628 00:32:45.360 --> 00:32:46.980 And that's partly because these movements  
629 00:32:46.980 --> 00:32:48.000 have achieved a lot.  
630 00:32:48.000 --> 00:32:52.140 So we've got anti protest laws in country after  
country,  
631 00:32:52.140 --> 00:32:53.220 which is also something  
632 00:32:53.220 --> 00:32:56.763 that I've started to research more and more,  
633 00:32:57.597 --> 00:33:00.150 but that's really changed the context  
634 00:33:00.150 --> 00:33:02.250 under which these protests take place.  
635 00:33:02.250 --> 00:33:06.793 So the scope is smaller in a way.  
636 00:33:06.793 --> 00:33:11.793 Another question that's been raised around  
this is violence.  
637 00:33:11.970 --> 00:33:15.420 So Roger Hallam is a very nonviolent,  
638 00:33:15.420 --> 00:33:18.390 so you know, very much professing nonvio-  
lence.  
639 00:33:18.390 --> 00:33:22.530 That's obviously something that has been  
more questioned

640 00:33:22.530 --> 00:33:25.380 and is also something that I often discuss with my students,

641 00:33:25.380 --> 00:33:28.500 you know, what is violence actually?

642 00:33:28.500 --> 00:33:30.630 Can you be violent against things?

643 00:33:30.630 --> 00:33:35.630 For example, is sabotage of objects a violent act?

644 00:33:38.670 --> 00:33:41.070 It's certainly classified as such by our governments,

645 00:33:41.070 --> 00:33:43.053 but is it so ethically?

646 00:33:44.013 --> 00:33:46.710 And that's obviously something

647 00:33:46.710 --> 00:33:51.293 that is also increasingly questioned and played with,

648 00:33:51.293 --> 00:33:53.850 I mean, this "How to Blow Up a Pipeline"

649 00:33:53.850 --> 00:33:57.630 new film coming out I've seen or I've seen trailers for.

650 00:33:57.630 --> 00:33:59.190 It's probably already out.

651 00:33:59.190 --> 00:34:04.080 And obviously also one thing that Hallam

652 00:34:04.080 --> 00:34:07.933 and this kind of Hallamism has been critiqued for

653 00:34:07.933 --> 00:34:09.090 is that it hasn't been very good

654 00:34:09.090 --> 00:34:11.880 at building movements, building broader movements.

655 00:34:11.880 --> 00:34:14.013 So it's not really,

656 00:34:14.013 --> 00:34:19.013 it doesn't really have a political vision and has seen,

657 00:34:20.160 --> 00:34:22.009 they have seen that as,

658 00:34:22.009 --> 00:34:27.009 that's a good thing as in like we can pull in more people

659 00:34:27.010 --> 00:34:30.270 if we don't have a very clear political vision.

660 00:34:30.270 --> 00:34:33.870 But it can also I think, be limiting.

661 00:34:33.870 --> 00:34:38.870 And it has, obviously, they are doing very risky things

662 00:34:39.133 --> 00:34:42.513 and that also has not been, you know,

663 00:34:42.513 --> 00:34:45.173 that make it difficult to draw in,

664 00:34:45.173 --> 00:34:49.470 drawing large numbers of people.

665 00:34:49.470 --> 00:34:53.220 So I'm not convinced that it has done very much

666 00:34:53.220 --> 00:34:56.670 to build a kind of broader climate movement.

667 00:34:56.670 --> 00:35:00.030 Now they will say that that's because,

668 00:35:00.030 --> 00:35:02.100 well, we are part of a radical flank

669 00:35:02.100 --> 00:35:04.560 to a more kind of moderate flank

670 00:35:04.560 --> 00:35:07.432 in the broader climate movement.

671 00:35:07.432 --> 00:35:10.290 And now you can see how it can do like that

672 00:35:10.290 --> 00:35:12.930 because they kind of open up spaces for conversation.

673 00:35:12.930 --> 00:35:15.930 And in that case, you know, I kind of buy into that,

674 00:35:15.930 --> 00:35:19.080 that it certainly has done that.

675 00:35:19.080 --> 00:35:21.930 But in terms of a, I don't,

676 00:35:21.930 --> 00:35:23.520 I'm not sure I would call them radical

677 00:35:23.520 --> 00:35:27.300 because although the actions are risky,

678 00:35:27.300 --> 00:35:31.546 the lack of political vision within it really,

679 00:35:31.546 --> 00:35:35.984 kind of ideology or whatever you want to call it,

680 00:35:35.984 --> 00:35:39.870 makes it maybe not all that radical, right?

681 00:35:39.870 --> 00:35:43.346 Like, I mean as in it's difficult to, they're not,

682 00:35:43.346 --> 00:35:45.900 although they're radical in their actions,

683 00:35:45.900 --> 00:35:47.450 they're not necessarily radical

684 00:35:48.424 --> 00:35:52.620 in what they envision for the world.

685 00:35:52.620 --> 00:35:54.779 I'm gonna skip that slide

686 00:35:54.779 --> 00:35:57.033 because I want to go ahead to the questions,

687 00:35:58.130 --> 00:35:59.700 but largely I suppose

688 00:35:59.700 --> 00:36:02.190 if I would speak to a group of activists,

689 00:36:02.190 --> 00:36:04.260 I would say, you know,

690 00:36:04.260 --> 00:36:06.810 and I recently came out with a co-authored paper

691 00:36:06.810 --> 00:36:08.846 that questions this, you know,

692 00:36:08.846 --> 00:36:11.460 what do climate activists mean when they say  
system change,

693 00:36:11.460 --> 00:36:14.763 not climate change, whose system, what  
changed?

694 00:36:15.600 --> 00:36:18.360 And when I asked, you know, this question,

695 00:36:18.360 --> 00:36:22.306 who and what stands in the way for action  
on climate change,

696 00:36:22.306 --> 00:36:25.546 I had a kind of session with student activist  
about this

697 00:36:25.546 --> 00:36:28.082 a few weeks ago during strikes here.

698 00:36:28.082 --> 00:36:32.160 And what comes out then is all, you know,

699 00:36:32.160 --> 00:36:34.350 some kind of version of wealth capitalism

700 00:36:34.350 --> 00:36:35.760 or how the economy works

701 00:36:35.760 --> 00:36:37.560 actually property rights and you know,

702 00:36:37.560 --> 00:36:42.560 who has the right to do what with what kind  
of property,

703 00:36:42.610 --> 00:36:45.826 profit motive, the need for growth

704 00:36:45.826 --> 00:36:48.690 or things that stand in the way

705 00:36:48.690 --> 00:36:50.140 for action on climate change.

706 00:36:51.450 --> 00:36:53.760 If those are kind of structural reasons

707 00:36:53.760 --> 00:36:56.010 then you have certain agents, you know,

708 00:36:56.010 --> 00:36:58.650 private actors, private certain sectors,

709 00:36:58.650 --> 00:37:00.990 obviously, not least the fossil fuel industry,

710 00:37:00.990 --> 00:37:05.990 but also other industries such as the financial  
industry

711 00:37:06.270 --> 00:37:07.680 that might stand in the way,

712 00:37:07.680 --> 00:37:10.000 certain state actors that stand in the way

713 00:37:10.986 --> 00:37:12.480 and also this kind of broader culture

714 00:37:12.480 --> 00:37:14.986 or kind of consumerist culture

715 00:37:14.986 --> 00:37:19.986 and a political culture that limits us.

716 00:37:21.210 --> 00:37:23.083 This came through from students as well,

717 00:37:23.083 --> 00:37:25.890 a political culture that limits our vision

718 00:37:25.890 --> 00:37:29.310 or what is possible in a way.

719 00:37:29.310 --> 00:37:30.960 So what I would, you know,

720 00:37:30.960 --> 00:37:35.790 I don't like telling people what the right thing to do is,

721 00:37:35.790 --> 00:37:37.350 but I do like to ask people

722 00:37:37.350 --> 00:37:40.410 to think why they're doing what they're doing.

723 00:37:40.410 --> 00:37:45.410 And so after setting out these things that are wrong,

724 00:37:45.690 --> 00:37:49.830 you know, when and how do what we do as activists,

725 00:37:49.830 --> 00:37:53.940 when does that weaken the structures and actors

726 00:37:53.940 --> 00:37:57.330 that we have set out here or that I set out together

727 00:37:57.330 --> 00:37:59.340 with that group of kind of student activists,

728 00:37:59.340 --> 00:38:03.090 when do what we do weaken the power

729 00:38:03.090 --> 00:38:05.430 of those structures and actors

730 00:38:05.430 --> 00:38:09.570 because that's really what we need to do.

731 00:38:09.570 --> 00:38:13.680 And not presume that attention in itself

732 00:38:13.680 --> 00:38:17.373 is going to win the fight for us.

733 00:38:18.660 --> 00:38:22.110 I think I'll stop there and open up for questions,

734 00:38:22.110 --> 00:38:24.310 which will be moderated by Laura, I believe.

735 00:38:27.114 --> 00:38:28.680 <v -> All right, thank you Dr. Berglund.</v>

736 00:38:28.680 --> 00:38:30.930 That was extremely edifying

737 00:38:30.930 --> 00:38:32.520 and I would just like to thank you

738 00:38:32.520 --> 00:38:35.130 for doing what we do in public health,

739 00:38:35.130 --> 00:38:38.874 which is having an evidence base for everything,

740 00:38:38.874 --> 00:38:40.560 (laughs) at least we try.

741 00:38:40.560 --> 00:38:43.140 And so being so thoughtful

742 00:38:43.140 --> 00:38:47.550 and turning this topic into an area of scholarly work,

743 00:38:47.550 --> 00:38:49.680 I think is extremely helpful.

744 00:38:49.680 --> 00:38:52.309 We've got a lot of excitement here,

745 00:38:52.309 --> 00:38:54.150 so I'm gonna jump right in.

746 00:38:54.150 --> 00:38:57.363 We had a question come in on the chat.

747 00:38:58.200 --> 00:39:01.230 Let me open this one up.

748 00:39:01.230 --> 00:39:05.280 This came in from Elon Martin Prachat,

749 00:39:05.280 --> 00:39:08.490 I'm sorry if I'm not pronouncing your name properly.

750 00:39:08.490 --> 00:39:12.154 We're grateful to have you here from Quebec, Canada.

751 00:39:12.154 --> 00:39:14.290 Elon is a high school student

752 00:39:14.290 --> 00:39:18.540 and we're especially grateful to have youth here

753 00:39:18.540 --> 00:39:22.860 because obviously there's a lot that is affecting all of us,

754 00:39:22.860 --> 00:39:26.010 but particularly younger generations.

755 00:39:26.010 --> 00:39:27.490 The question is,

756 00:39:27.490 --> 00:39:32.388 to what extent can indirect civil disobedience

757 00:39:32.388 --> 00:39:35.310 effectively tackle climate change

758 00:39:35.310 --> 00:39:38.463 when direct civil disobedience is impossible?

759 00:39:41.970 --> 00:39:45.510 <v ->So there are a few different definitions</v>

760 00:39:45.510 --> 00:39:48.480 about what indirect and direct civil disobedience is.

761 00:39:48.480 --> 00:39:51.630 So Rawls' definition of what direct civil disobedience

762 00:39:51.630 --> 00:39:53.770 is to directly break the law

763 00:39:53.770 --> 00:39:56.940 that you are protesting against.

764 00:39:56.940 --> 00:40:01.690 So I'm gonna presume that it's something along those lines,

765 00:40:01.690 --> 00:40:06.690 correct me if I'm wrong, but that's kind of like if it's,

766 00:40:09.330 --> 00:40:13.887 so some kinds of direct disobedience are possible

767 00:40:13.887 --> 00:40:16.950 and we often see those

768 00:40:16.950 --> 00:40:21.950 as the more successful civil disobedience campaigns

769 00:40:23.730 --> 00:40:26.520 and they tend to be anti-extractivist struggles.

770 00:40:26.520 --> 00:40:31.520 So we can see them in a lot of places in the world.

771 00:40:32.190 --> 00:40:36.150 You have examples from the US

772 00:40:36.150 --> 00:40:39.960 with the North Dakota access pipeline, for example,

773 00:40:39.960 --> 00:40:42.093 that went global in its reach.

774 00:40:43.140 --> 00:40:47.340 And you have many anti-extractivist struggles

775 00:40:47.340 --> 00:40:49.890 across Latin America that I'm familiar with.

776 00:40:49.890 --> 00:40:52.320 My dad's and different family members

777 00:40:52.320 --> 00:40:55.946 have been really involved in many of those.

778 00:40:55.946 --> 00:41:00.270 In the UK for example, I mean, fracking was stopped,

779 00:41:00.270 --> 00:41:02.850 like fracking is not practiced in the UK.

780 00:41:02.850 --> 00:41:07.850 It was stopped and largely by anti-fracking activists

781 00:41:09.843 --> 00:41:12.540 that stopped fracking at site.

782 00:41:12.540 --> 00:41:14.970 So you can see that as kind of direct action,

783 00:41:14.970 --> 00:41:19.970 like we're stopping what is and yeah, the kind of,

784 00:41:20.460 --> 00:41:22.830 if you by indirect mean the,

785 00:41:22.830 --> 00:41:24.546 okay, we're sitting on a road

786 00:41:24.546 --> 00:41:28.290 outside London in order to stop,

787 00:41:28.290 --> 00:41:30.090 in order to get the government

788 00:41:30.090 --> 00:41:34.830 to put loads of money into insulating homes,

789 00:41:34.830 --> 00:41:37.330 that is a less direct action.

790 00:41:37.330 --> 00:41:42.330 So I mean, but what they actually achieved, for example,

791 00:41:43.110 --> 00:41:44.457 was to really politicize

792 00:41:44.457 --> 00:41:46.770 the issue of house and home insulation,

793 00:41:46.770 --> 00:41:50.640 which for the UK is a really big deal if we are gonna,

794 00:41:50.640 --> 00:41:54.300 get anywhere near to reach the kind of emission targets

795 00:41:54.300 --> 00:41:56.580 that we have because there's a lot of leakage of heat

796 00:41:56.580 --> 00:41:58.110 from British homes, right?

797 00:41:58.110 --> 00:42:00.120 It's a really old kind of housing stock

798 00:42:00.120 --> 00:42:01.530 and it's a big, it's a big problem.

799 00:42:01.530 --> 00:42:05.634 So insulating homes in Britain is a big deal.

800 00:42:05.634 --> 00:42:06.960 And you know, they did.

801 00:42:06.960 --> 00:42:11.580 They did insulate, so they did get home insulation

802 00:42:11.580 --> 00:42:15.840 to become a much bigger political issue than it was.

803 00:42:15.840 --> 00:42:18.450 So my colleague here at University of Bristol,

804 00:42:18.450 --> 00:42:21.360 Colin Davis who I work, he's a clinical psychologist,

805 00:42:21.360 --> 00:42:23.392 but he works a lot on,

806 00:42:23.392 --> 00:42:26.070 sorry, cognitive psychology professor,

807 00:42:26.070 --> 00:42:29.160 but he works a lot on these issues.

808 00:42:29.160 --> 00:42:30.810 So climate protests as well,

809 00:42:30.810 --> 00:42:34.413 more on the getting arrested end of it than I have myself.

810 00:42:35.310 --> 00:42:39.426 But he did research about home insulation

811 00:42:39.426 --> 00:42:42.370 and tracked it in the media and saw that,

812 00:42:42.370 --> 00:42:43.203 well, actually home insulation

813 00:42:43.203 --> 00:42:44.790 is being talked about much more,

814 00:42:44.790 --> 00:42:46.110 you know, it went like this.

815 00:42:46.110 --> 00:42:49.330 And not just related to the protests themselves,

816 00:42:49.330 --> 00:42:50.490 but in general following the protest.

817 00:42:50.490 --> 00:42:55.490 So there is obviously stuff we can do that we can achieve.



818 00:42:55.530 --> 00:42:59.400 Now the biggest political things of like,  
819 00:42:59.400 --> 00:43:03.270 you know, are we actually saving the world?  
820 00:43:03.270 --> 00:43:07.650 I mean, that's really difficult to find evidence  
for, right?  
821 00:43:07.650 --> 00:43:12.650 But the kind of things that we can measure  
are things like,  
822 00:43:13.328 --> 00:43:15.549 you know, okay, so how,  
823 00:43:15.549 --> 00:43:18.300 what kind of media attention are we getting  
824 00:43:18.300 --> 00:43:19.530 with the things we're doing,  
825 00:43:19.530 --> 00:43:23.040 with these indirect forms of protest?  
826 00:43:23.040 --> 00:43:27.000 And obviously, if homes are eventually insu-  
lated,  
827 00:43:27.000 --> 00:43:31.594 the direct action will be one part of what  
achieved that.  
828 00:43:31.594 --> 00:43:34.146 And actually it's part of a much broader,  
829 00:43:34.146 --> 00:43:38.790 you know, many broader political processes.  
830 00:43:38.790 --> 00:43:39.623 Yeah.  
831 00:43:45.930 --> 00:43:47.220 <v ->Oh sorry.</v>  
832 00:43:47.220 --> 00:43:48.750 That was excellent, thank you.  
833 00:43:48.750 --> 00:43:49.803 David Hughes.  
834 00:43:50.880 --> 00:43:52.410 <v ->Yeah, thanks.</v>  
835 00:43:52.410 --> 00:43:53.280 I really enjoyed the presentation.  
836 00:43:53.280 --> 00:43:56.180 I'm calling in here from Rutgers University of  
New Jersey.  
837 00:43:57.090 --> 00:44:00.783 I have a question about accepting the legal  
consequences.  
838 00:44:01.650 --> 00:44:04.740 You suggested that that was a necessary com-  
ponent  
839 00:44:04.740 --> 00:44:09.270 in civil disobedience or in in nonviolent direct  
action?  
840 00:44:09.270 --> 00:44:12.270 Well, it actually was the civil disobedience  
part.  
841 00:44:12.270 --> 00:44:14.790 So I wonder, I mean, I heard recently

842 00:44:14.790 --> 00:44:18.960 that some XR people in Britain were found not guilty

843 00:44:18.960 --> 00:44:22.020 in a trial through jury nullification.

844 00:44:22.020 --> 00:44:23.793 And I'm studying, in fact,

845 00:44:24.630 --> 00:44:27.000 some civil disobedience movements in New England,

846 00:44:27.000 --> 00:44:28.380 which are again, you know,

847 00:44:28.380 --> 00:44:31.533 have gone to trial hoping for jury nullification.

848 00:44:32.670 --> 00:44:35.460 Also various activists have tried

849 00:44:35.460 --> 00:44:38.100 to use the necessity defense,

850 00:44:38.100 --> 00:44:41.700 which is another way of avoiding jail time and fines.

851 00:44:41.700 --> 00:44:44.310 And of course, if one can get away with it,

852 00:44:44.310 --> 00:44:47.010 then the number of people able to do civil disobedience

853 00:44:47.010 --> 00:44:48.810 will grow very substantially.

854 00:44:48.810 --> 00:44:50.100 So I guess my question is,

855 00:44:50.100 --> 00:44:53.700 I mean, what do you think of the jury nullification route

856 00:44:53.700 --> 00:44:57.490 in the UK and the US and you know,

857 00:44:57.490 --> 00:45:01.443 is bearing the legal consequences that necessary?

858 00:45:03.000 --> 00:45:07.200 <v ->Before, could you just specify what jury nullification is?</v>

859 00:45:07.200 --> 00:45:10.080 <v ->Oh, that's where a jury believes,</v>

860 00:45:10.080 --> 00:45:15.080 a juror or jury believes that the defendant did the crime,

861 00:45:15.836 --> 00:45:19.530 but they decide to set the law aside.

862 00:45:19.530 --> 00:45:20.363 <v ->Yeah, okay.</v>

863 00:45:21.306 --> 00:45:22.139 <v ->It is a power but not a right</v>

864 00:45:22.139 --> 00:45:24.570 that jurors in both countries have.

865 00:45:24.570 --> 00:45:26.070 <v ->Yeah, absolutely.</v>

866 00:45:26.070 --> 00:45:30.235 So the US and the UK are interesting cases there

867 00:45:30.235 --> 00:45:33.306 because we have trial by jury in both these countries.

868 00:45:33.306 --> 00:45:34.440 You know, in Sweden where I'm from,

869 00:45:34.440 --> 00:45:35.760 we don't have trial by jury.

870 00:45:35.760 --> 00:45:38.520 So that doesn't become an option.

871 00:45:38.520 --> 00:45:43.320 So in the UK it's been a tactic by some activists

872 00:45:43.320 --> 00:45:45.506 to get a jury to create,

873 00:45:45.506 --> 00:45:48.660 to produce as much damage that they,

874 00:45:48.660 --> 00:45:49.590 that it would warrant,

875 00:45:49.590 --> 00:45:52.650 that it would kind of qualify to be tried by a jury.

876 00:45:52.650 --> 00:45:56.250 And very, very often we are found not guilty.

877 00:45:56.250 --> 00:46:00.379 The necessity claiming that, you know,

878 00:46:00.379 --> 00:46:02.910 you had a necessity to do what you need.

879 00:46:02.910 --> 00:46:06.330 That hasn't tended to be that successful in the UK.

880 00:46:06.330 --> 00:46:08.430 It's got a very poor success rate.

881 00:46:08.430 --> 00:46:10.985 So as a defense,

882 00:46:10.985 --> 00:46:14.400 I know this because my colleague Graham Hayes

883 00:46:14.400 --> 00:46:15.930 who works on this,

884 00:46:15.930 --> 00:46:18.300 who follows more the trials of these things

885 00:46:18.300 --> 00:46:20.760 than I do myself as I made that observation,

886 00:46:20.760 --> 00:46:22.020 I'm not sure what,

887 00:46:22.020 --> 00:46:25.490 how the necessity defense in the US,

888 00:46:25.490 --> 00:46:30.490 how if it's been successful or not.

889 00:46:31.020 --> 00:46:32.640 But what I would say about all of these

890 00:46:32.640 --> 00:46:35.010 is that at the same time,

891 00:46:35.010 --> 00:46:39.090 so we do have like, I mean juries and court-rooms

892 00:46:39.090 --> 00:46:44.090 can be arenas to carry out this activism as well.

893 00:46:46.210 --> 00:46:49.200 And it's obviously something  
894 00:46:49.200 --> 00:46:51.150 that activists have learned more,  
895 00:46:51.150 --> 00:46:53.103 like to start with didn't really.  
896 00:46:54.210 --> 00:46:58.604 Extinction Berlin weren't very good at using  
courtroom  
897 00:46:58.604 --> 00:47:03.300 as a space to get the message out.  
898 00:47:03.300 --> 00:47:06.423 I suppose it was more about trying to get  
acquitted.  
899 00:47:08.160 --> 00:47:11.946 It really depends here on the judge and so on.  
900 00:47:11.946 --> 00:47:13.650 And obviously what we must also take into  
account here  
901 00:47:13.650 --> 00:47:17.730 is that there's real efforts by states and by,  
902 00:47:19.950 --> 00:47:22.210 well, government certainly in the UK  
903 00:47:22.210 --> 00:47:25.625 and I know that many states in the US  
904 00:47:25.625 --> 00:47:30.625 also to limit our right to protest.  
905 00:47:31.290 --> 00:47:35.760 And that makes jury nullification in a way  
harder.  
906 00:47:35.760 --> 00:47:39.343 So I mean, there was a very publicized case  
here in the UK  
907 00:47:39.343 --> 00:47:44.343 where one of the defendants was sent to prison  
for,  
908 00:47:46.560 --> 00:47:48.780 because he was prohibited by the judge  
909 00:47:48.780 --> 00:47:50.830 to mention climate change in his trial  
910 00:47:52.210 --> 00:47:54.630 and he opposed that, right?  
911 00:47:54.630 --> 00:47:58.980 And he mentioned climate change and was  
sent to prison  
912 00:47:58.980 --> 00:48:01.282 on that basis for, you know,  
913 00:48:01.282 --> 00:48:05.523 I don't know how many months as a contempt  
of court.  
914 00:48:06.570 --> 00:48:10.650 So I don't know if it answers your question,  
915 00:48:10.650 --> 00:48:15.420 but the necessity defense hasn't been success-  
ful in the UK,  
916 00:48:15.420 --> 00:48:20.184 but there has been plenty of nullifications by  
jury

917 00:48:20.184 --> 00:48:25.184 and also finding not guilty as well and also,  
 918 00:48:26.250 --> 00:48:30.900 but that is becoming harder, and that's a  
 background,  
 919 00:48:30.900 --> 00:48:33.600 you know, when these,  
 920 00:48:33.600 --> 00:48:35.640 when the police crime sentencing  
 921 00:48:35.640 --> 00:48:37.980 and court bill came through in the UK,  
 922 00:48:37.980 --> 00:48:41.310 which was an anti-protest bill that I organized,  
 923 00:48:41.310 --> 00:48:46.310 a letter signed by over 400 environment related  
 academics  
 924 00:48:46.642 --> 00:48:49.019 around the world to protest  
 925 00:48:49.019 --> 00:48:53.906 the criminalization of protestors.  
 926 00:48:53.906 --> 00:48:57.000 And I think that's a real battleground.  
 927 00:48:57.000 --> 00:49:02.000 Like, the UN Secretary General has said as  
 much as well.  
 928 00:49:04.923 --> 00:49:09.240 And it's something where that I think that  
 929 00:49:09.240 --> 00:49:10.930 more and more of us need to really  
 930 00:49:10.930 --> 00:49:13.922 turn our attention to and protest.  
 931 00:49:13.922 --> 00:49:14.755 And you know, here in the UK,  
 932 00:49:14.755 --> 00:49:18.540 we hope that that's kind of criminalization  
 will stop,  
 933 00:49:18.540 --> 00:49:21.270 will be halted when we get a new government,  
 934 00:49:21.270 --> 00:49:24.600 which we know that will do pretty soon.  
 935 00:49:24.600 --> 00:49:27.060 But I'm not sure this,  
 936 00:49:27.060 --> 00:49:30.630 the trend of criminalizing climate protestors  
 937 00:49:30.630 --> 00:49:33.642 and making it harder to get away  
 938 00:49:33.642 --> 00:49:38.253 and be let off by juries is a global trend.  
 939 00:49:42.780 --> 00:49:44.280 <v ->Thank you so much.</v>  
 940 00:49:44.280 --> 00:49:47.040 We have a question that came in from Jack  
 Markowitz,  
 941 00:49:47.040 --> 00:49:49.470 which is you've used, sorry,  
 942 00:49:49.470 --> 00:49:51.450 you've used the terms protest,  
 943 00:49:51.450 --> 00:49:54.810 civil disobedience, disobedience movement.

944 00:49:54.810 --> 00:49:56.400 What, if any, are the differences  
 945 00:49:56.400 --> 00:49:58.560 between these different forms of action?  
 946 00:49:58.560 --> 00:50:01.266 So protest, civil disobedience,  
 947 00:50:01.266 --> 00:50:04.800 and disobedience slash movement?  
 948 00:50:04.800 --> 00:50:06.393 <v ->Yeah, good question.</v>  
 949 00:50:07.230 --> 00:50:10.740 So I mean, protest is anything that you,  
 950 00:50:10.740 --> 00:50:12.870 you know, protest.  
 951 00:50:12.870 --> 00:50:16.140 So if you stand outside somewhere with a  
 placard,  
 952 00:50:16.140 --> 00:50:19.020 you are protesting something, right?  
 953 00:50:19.020 --> 00:50:21.780 And I think a lot of this kind of wave of  
 climate activism  
 954 00:50:21.780 --> 00:50:25.260 has obviously been kind of going beyond  
 955 00:50:25.260 --> 00:50:30.260 that kind of protest to be more disruptive.  
 956 00:50:30.360 --> 00:50:33.099 So I often talk about disruptive protest  
 957 00:50:33.099 --> 00:50:35.181 and civil disobedience  
 958 00:50:35.181 --> 00:50:38.070 is really one way of understanding this  
 959 00:50:38.070 --> 00:50:41.550 that comes from this kind of liberal tradition  
 960 00:50:41.550 --> 00:50:44.607 of thinking about political theory.  
 961 00:50:44.607 --> 00:50:46.233 And whereas I, you know,  
 962 00:50:46.233 --> 00:50:49.740 also set out the kind of anarchist who think  
 more about,  
 963 00:50:49.740 --> 00:50:52.380 more about it in terms of direct action,  
 964 00:50:52.380 --> 00:50:56.280 that's what the kind of terminology that they  
 prefer.  
 965 00:50:56.280 --> 00:50:59.553 So really civil disobedience and direct action  
 become,  
 966 00:51:01.088 --> 00:51:06.088 have a certain ideological or theoretical polit-  
 ical baggage  
 967 00:51:06.630 --> 00:51:09.540 with them when we use those terms.  
 968 00:51:09.540 --> 00:51:10.582 Which, you know,  
 969 00:51:10.582 --> 00:51:15.582 I try to use disruptive protest as a descriptor  
 of a protest

970 00:51:15.720 --> 00:51:19.650 that goes beyond just expressing your opinion

971 00:51:19.650 --> 00:51:24.300 and more about actually annoying somebody or something

972 00:51:24.300 --> 00:51:25.450 and stopping something.

973 00:51:31.260 --> 00:51:32.880 <v ->Excellent, that's really helpful.</v>

974 00:51:32.880 --> 00:51:34.923 Thank you, and good question.

975 00:51:36.138 --> 00:51:37.020 And from Dr. Dubrow,

976 00:51:37.020 --> 00:51:38.460 the Director of the Yale Center

977 00:51:38.460 --> 00:51:39.990 on Climate Change and Health,

978 00:51:39.990 --> 00:51:44.550 who are so grateful of supporting this seminar series.

979 00:51:44.550 --> 00:51:46.500 My anecdotal observation is that

980 00:51:46.500 --> 00:51:49.350 the climate change disobedience direct action movement

981 00:51:49.350 --> 00:51:51.960 in the US is attracting increasing participation

982 00:51:51.960 --> 00:51:53.370 by people of color,

983 00:51:53.370 --> 00:51:56.280 especially when climate change is linked to issues

984 00:51:56.280 --> 00:51:59.370 like housing or criminal justice, for example.

985 00:51:59.370 --> 00:52:00.630 Do you see any potential

986 00:52:00.630 --> 00:52:02.520 for a mass climate change

987 00:52:02.520 --> 00:52:04.890 civil disobedience direct action movement

988 00:52:04.890 --> 00:52:08.673 similar to the US Civil Rights movement in the 1960s?

989 00:52:10.290 --> 00:52:15.290 <v ->I hope so, I mean, I think it has to be, I often say,</v>

990 00:52:15.450 --> 00:52:19.140 and I think I ended my last paper with

991 00:52:19.140 --> 00:52:20.340 the struggle for climate justice

992 00:52:20.340 --> 00:52:23.010 does not necessarily start with climate,

993 00:52:23.010 --> 00:52:25.010 but that this is,

994 00:52:25.010 --> 00:52:30.010 that it needs to become a much broader, broader movement.

995 00:52:33.240 --> 00:52:35.340 And although I think that there was a tendency

996 00:52:35.340 --> 00:52:39.150 when these movements first came in the UK

997 00:52:39.150 --> 00:52:41.262 with Extinction Rebellion that,

998 00:52:41.262 --> 00:52:42.300 you know, to depoliticize it,

999 00:52:42.300 --> 00:52:45.060 but actually we don't need to depoliticize it.

1000 00:52:45.060 --> 00:52:46.920 We need to politicize it, right?

1001 00:52:46.920 --> 00:52:48.000 We need to, you know,

1002 00:52:48.000 --> 00:52:50.730 climate change is deeply political

1003 00:52:50.730 --> 00:52:53.190 and we know that of course,

1004 00:52:53.190 --> 00:52:56.760 you will know as well as I do that climate change

1005 00:52:58.530 --> 00:53:00.810 is the greatest kind of injustice

1006 00:53:00.810 --> 00:53:02.970 and how it hits people and you know,

1007 00:53:02.970 --> 00:53:06.477 it along, you know, class and race,

1008 00:53:06.477 --> 00:53:11.477 racist kind of lines in in the US itself

1009 00:53:13.320 --> 00:53:17.490 and of course, you know, globally even more so.

1010 00:53:17.490 --> 00:53:19.650 And it's absolutely essential, I think,

1011 00:53:19.650 --> 00:53:22.980 to link it to these other issues.

1012 00:53:22.980 --> 00:53:25.440 Now, the extent to whether that's happening,

1013 00:53:25.440 --> 00:53:29.280 you will probably see better in the US to whether,

1014 00:53:29.280 --> 00:53:31.260 to the extent to which that's happening.

1015 00:53:31.260 --> 00:53:33.840 I mean, obviously the environmental justice movement

1016 00:53:33.840 --> 00:53:38.840 is a kind of inherently, kind anti-racist,

1017 00:53:38.946 --> 00:53:42.786 a movement in the US that has foundations in the US

1018 00:53:42.786 --> 00:53:46.980 and that's kind of given rise to climate justice as well.

1019 00:53:46.980 --> 00:53:48.090 And you know,

1020 00:53:48.090 --> 00:53:50.822 I think it's significant that climate justice



1021 00:53:50.822 --> 00:53:53.040 was not a demand of Extinction Rebellion in the UK

1022 00:53:53.040 --> 00:53:57.450 but it became a demand of Extinction Rebellion in the US.

1023 00:53:57.450 --> 00:54:01.260 So I think that there is in the US climate movement,

1024 00:54:01.260 --> 00:54:04.122 but this is my impression from kind of afar

1025 00:54:04.122 --> 00:54:08.264 that those kind of climate justice issues

1026 00:54:08.264 --> 00:54:11.666 which are much more politicized,

1027 00:54:11.666 --> 00:54:16.666 have a stronger root in the climate change movement

1028 00:54:17.520 --> 00:54:20.490 in the US than they do on this side of the Atlantic.

1029 00:54:20.490 --> 00:54:25.357 That it's more white and middle class in Europe

1030 00:54:25.357 --> 00:54:27.780 than it is in the US.

1031 00:54:27.780 --> 00:54:29.460 But certainly the impression you get

1032 00:54:29.460 --> 00:54:32.523 from from seeing it from afar, you'll know better.

1033 00:54:35.100 --> 00:54:36.480 <v ->Thank you.</v>

1034 00:54:36.480 --> 00:54:40.183 A question from Chris in Berlin,

1035 00:54:40.183 --> 00:54:45.183 what are the CD tactics in the UK

1036 00:54:45.663 --> 00:54:48.750 that have had the most impact?

1037 00:54:48.750 --> 00:54:51.000 So what are the civil disobedience tactics

1038 00:54:51.000 --> 00:54:52.623 that have been most effective?

1039 00:54:54.823 --> 00:54:56.443 <v ->Yeah, well, that there,</v>

1040 00:54:56.443 --> 00:54:58.260 I would say most effective to what?

1041 00:54:58.260 --> 00:54:59.250 I mean, obviously,

1042 00:54:59.250 --> 00:55:04.250 in a way this kind of wave all started with the,

1043 00:55:05.340 --> 00:55:07.498 not that Extinction Rebellion's first thing

1044 00:55:07.498 --> 00:55:10.440 was in April, 2019.

1045 00:55:10.440 --> 00:55:11.370 But their first, you know,

1046 00:55:11.370 --> 00:55:15.570 when they kind of became famous in April, 2019

1047 00:55:15.570 --> 00:55:20.570 was achieved a public opinion shift.

1048 00:55:20.882 --> 00:55:22.716 More people were concerned

1049 00:55:22.716 --> 00:55:25.740 about climate change than previously.

1050 00:55:25.740 --> 00:55:27.780 Fewer people denied its existence.

1051 00:55:27.780 --> 00:55:32.160 More people saw it as a priority, as a political priority,

1052 00:55:32.160 --> 00:55:34.950 so that we can see that in the kind of data

1053 00:55:34.950 --> 00:55:39.090 that it was a shift happening at at that time.

1054 00:55:39.090 --> 00:55:43.800 So, but it is so often with many kinds of protests,

1055 00:55:43.800 --> 00:55:45.450 it's a surprise element,

1056 00:55:45.450 --> 00:55:48.240 the novelty element that creates that.

1057 00:55:48.240 --> 00:55:49.950 So then when you try to recreate it,

1058 00:55:49.950 --> 00:55:52.170 well, then it doesn't have the same effect, right?

1059 00:55:52.170 --> 00:55:53.850 So a few months later,

1060 00:55:53.850 --> 00:55:56.823 then it didn't really achieve anything at all.

1061 00:55:58.710 --> 00:56:03.710 I mean the Insulate Britain protests did achieve

1062 00:56:04.066 --> 00:56:08.400 this kind of politicization of the insulation question,

1063 00:56:08.400 --> 00:56:10.770 like did push it, you know, higher up the agenda,

1064 00:56:10.770 --> 00:56:12.060 but that's just sitting in a road.

1065 00:56:12.060 --> 00:56:16.110 At other times sitting in a road achieves very little.

1066 00:56:16.110 --> 00:56:17.670 So it's actually really difficult

1067 00:56:17.670 --> 00:56:21.803 to say what particular tactics are the most,

1068 00:56:21.803 --> 00:56:26.803 that are the most kind of successful in a way.

1069 00:56:27.000 --> 00:56:29.910 As I said, with any kind of

1070 00:56:29.910 --> 00:56:33.003 civil disobedience or direct action,

1071 00:56:33.003 --> 00:56:35.490 the more local your target is,  
 1072 00:56:35.490 --> 00:56:39.266 the more the greater will your chances be  
 1073 00:56:39.266 --> 00:56:43.580 of getting a direct effect  
 1074 00:56:43.580 --> 00:56:46.863 or direct result from your actions.  
 1075 00:56:48.450 --> 00:56:49.500 <v ->Thank you.</v>  
 1076 00:56:49.500 --> 00:56:51.420 I would also wonder what the role is  
 1077 00:56:51.420 --> 00:56:54.927 for the simplicity of the objective, right?  
 1078 00:56:54.927 --> 00:56:57.630 And the fact that people are advocating  
 1079 00:56:57.630 --> 00:57:00.510 on behalf of all of us, indeed all species,  
 1080 00:57:00.510 --> 00:57:03.570 all of life as opposed to a specific group.  
 1081 00:57:03.570 --> 00:57:06.420 You know, there's a certain sensibility  
 1082 00:57:06.420 --> 00:57:10.802 asking for insulation is so, (laughs) so sensi-  
 ble.  
 1083 00:57:10.802 --> 00:57:12.720 We have a question from,  
 1084 00:57:12.720 --> 00:57:15.090 and I'm sorry Marielle Evelyn Tucker,  
 1085 00:57:15.090 --> 00:57:16.230 I'm a huge fan of yours.  
 1086 00:57:16.230 --> 00:57:17.986 I would love to get to your question,  
 1087 00:57:17.986 --> 00:57:20.730 (laughs) but we're just out of time.  
 1088 00:57:20.730 --> 00:57:22.680 We have room for one more question.  
 1089 00:57:22.680 --> 00:57:24.690 Samuel Gold, great question as well.  
 1090 00:57:24.690 --> 00:57:26.520 Given the authoritarian backlash,  
 1091 00:57:26.520 --> 00:57:29.970 can civil disobedience remain as effective  
 means of protest  
 1092 00:57:29.970 --> 00:57:32.610 in the long term or does it become too unsafe  
 1093 00:57:32.610 --> 00:57:36.300 and too unacceptable as it already is for  
 many,  
 1094 00:57:36.300 --> 00:57:38.913 for people to perform acts of civil disobedi-  
 ence?  
 1095 00:57:39.780 --> 00:57:40.950 <v ->So I mean,</v>  
 1096 00:57:40.950 --> 00:57:42.900 we know that being a climate activist or you  
 know,  
 1097 00:57:42.900 --> 00:57:45.540 an environmental activist is one of the most  
 dangerous thing

1098 00:57:45.540 --> 00:57:48.081 you can do in many countries in the world,  
you know,

1099 00:57:48.081 --> 00:57:51.480 you have, I mean, Global Witness is an  
organization,

1100 00:57:51.480 --> 00:57:52.740 there's material I've used a lot

1101 00:57:52.740 --> 00:57:55.498 to is show how dangerous it is.

1102 00:57:55.498 --> 00:57:58.463 That and being a trade unionist with,

1103 00:57:58.463 --> 00:58:03.463 you know, people get killed, it's never safe.

1104 00:58:04.693 --> 00:58:06.330 It's never been safe.

1105 00:58:06.330 --> 00:58:07.163 I mean, in a way,

1106 00:58:07.163 --> 00:58:08.880 if you make more and more things illegal,

1107 00:58:08.880 --> 00:58:11.430 then you know more things will be doing,

1108 00:58:11.430 --> 00:58:13.110 more people will be doing illegal things

1109 00:58:13.110 --> 00:58:16.080 because more things are illegal to do more,

1110 00:58:16.080 --> 00:58:18.610 more types of protest.

1111 00:58:18.610 --> 00:58:22.978 The fact is that who you are and where you  
are,

1112 00:58:22.978 --> 00:58:27.978 and what will affect the risks that you run  
of doing things.

1113 00:58:28.770 --> 00:58:33.770 We're often protected not by the law itself,

1114 00:58:34.920 --> 00:58:39.890 but by how that the police can't, for example,

1115 00:58:39.890 --> 00:58:43.620 the some of the anti-protest laws that come  
in

1116 00:58:43.620 --> 00:58:46.320 are absolutely inconceivable to think that  
the police

1117 00:58:46.320 --> 00:58:51.320 will actually act consistently on those anti-  
protest laws.

1118 00:58:51.330 --> 00:58:55.260 They will deploy them as and when they see  
fit

1119 00:58:55.260 --> 00:58:56.910 and when they think it's important

1120 00:58:56.910 --> 00:58:59.441 and when they think they can get away with  
it.

1121 00:58:59.441 --> 00:59:03.677 So this, yes,

1122 00:59:03.677 --> 00:59:06.767 we will see the civil disobedience and disobedience

1123 00:59:06.767 --> 00:59:10.170 and we will probably, you know, a decade down the line,

1124 00:59:10.170 --> 00:59:12.000 we will also see more violent, you know,

1125 00:59:12.000 --> 00:59:14.586 more sabotage and and so on, I'm sure.

1126 00:59:14.586 --> 00:59:16.106 So you can't, you know,

1127 00:59:16.106 --> 00:59:21.106 climate change is going to cause a lot of disruption

1128 00:59:21.146 --> 00:59:25.742 in itself within our lifetime

1129 00:59:25.742 --> 00:59:30.742 and people are going to take to desperate measures

1130 00:59:31.110 --> 00:59:33.270 to do something about it.

1131 00:59:33.270 --> 00:59:35.880 So I definitely think that we will see

1132 00:59:35.880 --> 00:59:39.650 all kinds of protests and that's not,

1133 00:59:39.650 --> 00:59:41.150 that can't be legislated away.

1134 00:59:44.730 --> 00:59:46.530 <v ->Thank you so much, Dr. Berglund.</v>

1135 00:59:46.530 --> 00:59:51.300 You bring a lot of intellectual and activists power

1136 00:59:51.300 --> 00:59:53.100 when you're discussing these things

1137 00:59:53.100 --> 00:59:54.270 in such a thoughtful way.

1138 00:59:54.270 --> 00:59:55.830 So we can't thank you enough

1139 00:59:55.830 --> 00:59:58.860 for taking the time to speak with us all today.

1140 00:59:58.860 --> 00:59:59.970 <v ->Thank you.</v>

1141 00:59:59.970 --> 01:00:02.370 It's been a great honor and so many names that I see

1142 01:00:02.370 --> 01:00:07.230 and respect hugely in (laughs) the audience as well.

1143 01:00:07.230 --> 01:00:08.130 So thank you so much.

1144 01:00:08.130 --> 01:00:10.230 Really good questions and really good discussions.

1145 01:00:10.230 --> 01:00:11.880 I really enjoyed it.

1146 01:00:11.880 --> 01:00:14.493 <v ->Thank you, all right.</v> <v ->Thanks, Oscar.</v>